

Business Case Competition comments

After watching the presentation of the research paper on the impact of the participation in business case competition on initial salary, there are some few points that can be fixed in this research paper. First of all, the research question and the objective itself is very difficult to measure and as mentioned by the author, the variable in the question can be very easily overestimated since the determination of the initial salary of the person can be credited to many more significant factors such as individual skills which is also hard to observed by questionnaire as well as number of activities and achievements or roles during the time in the university. The results can be very misleading if the data is not treated very carefully. The author also proposed a solution to fix the upward or overestimation bias of the variable in the question by identifying “unobserved heterogeneity” and “Avoid unnecessary variables” to prevent double misspecification which in this case, the author failed to do both.

For unobserved heterogeneity, the author can improve on this part by getting more relevance information and specification from using better questionnaire with focus moved to more relevant information that can actually impact the initial salary more such as the number of activities, roles or achievement during the time in university which will be specified in the resume when applying for the job. But again, to clearly identify individual skills and the interviewing skills are also impossible to identify.

For the solution to avoid unnecessary variables, I found that the author also failed to do this as well when the author included variables that are too irrelevant from initial salary such as parents' income when the author already identified the samples' study place so these variables can be removed to get better results. The author can also add more dummy variables on the

faculties of the samples as well since the portion of students from economics faculty add up only so much of the students participating in case competition. Faculties such as BBA or Faculty of arts(NITED) can also be added as a dummy to provide more specification since more of those students from these faculty engaged even more than the economics student in the case competition so they can be a good portion with impact on the result as well.

Finally, the goal of the research is not as significant as it sounds since more of the larger firms nowadays are taking resume less seriously than the past and they have their own interviewing and testing examination process to observe and they take these to come up with the initial salary for the newly graduated applying so the result that the author provided should be observed with more assumption and wider perception on the job application process.